

CITY OF MUSKEGON
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
MINUTES

November 3, 2004

The meeting was called to order at 4:00 p.m. by Vice-Chairperson, T. Bosma.

MEMBERS PRESENT: J. Hilt, L. Spataro, A. Medema, T. Bosma, T. Russo; A. Brown

MEMBERS ABSENT: None.

STAFF PRESENT: L. Anguilm, H.Griffith

OTHERS PRESENT: L. Pace, The House of Judah; B. Moore, 1873 Harrison; P. LeBlanc, LSL Associates, Inc.; T. Lidke, 1573 Jefferson; D. Jensen, 424 N Peterson.

A letter of resignation from the HDC was provided to the commission members from Dan Chambers. L. Anguilm informed the commission members that the Vice-Chair has stated that he would chair the meetings through the end of the year unless the commission members would prefer to elect another Chairperson instead.

L. Anguilm stated that the commission members were provided with information regarding a walk-on case that would be at their discretion if they would like to hear it at the end of the meeting. The commission members concurred that they would hear the case.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Medema arrived at 4:02 p.m.

A motion to approve the regular meeting minutes of October 5, 2004 was made by A. Brown, supported by J. Hilt and unanimously approved.

L. Spataro arrived at 4:05 p.m.

OLD BUSINESS

Case2004-33 – Request to construct a new marquee/sign with the name of the church.
Applicant: The House of Judah; 32 E. Forest Avenue; District: Clinton-Peck; Class: A.
L. Anguilm presented the staff report. The applicant is requesting to construct a new sign to replace the current signage on the property. Any signage must meet the Zoning Ordinance requirements and a permit must be obtained. The design is somewhat similar

to what is currently in place, but will be one sign instead of a series of several smaller signs attached to the large centerpiece. At the October meeting, it was not known what materials would be used, and so the request was tabled. New information provided indicates the sign will be built using treated 2 x 4s. The middle section will be a metal frame, which will list the times for services, as well as the name of the church. The sign will be lit with floodlights directed toward the sign. The logo areas will have frosted glass. Staff recommends approval of the request.

L. Pace explained that the brick portion would match the church. The logo would be of a white frosted glass. The lights would be floodlights at the bottom of the sign that would reflect on the sign face. The rest of the sign would be wood. J. Hilt asked if the wood would be painted or stained. L. Pace stated that it would probably be stained.

A motion that HDC approve the request to construct a new sign at the House of Judah, 32 E. Forest, with the following condition: The sign meet all requirements of the City of Muskegon Zoning Ordinance, was made by A. Medema, supported by T. Russo and unanimously approved.

NEW BUSINESS

Case2004-39 – Request for Historic District review of Special Use Permit in “H” Heritage Zoning. Applicant: Brenda Moore; 607 & 611 W. Clay Avenue; District: None at this time. L. Anguilm presented the staff report. The applicant is requesting a review by HDC, as is required in the Zoning Ordinance for a Special Use Permit in the “H” Heritage zoning. The Special Use Permit request is for any retail business or service establishments permitted as Principal Uses in the B-1, Limited Business District. The commission members were provided with the zoning district languages of the H and B-1 districts. Staff recommends approval of the request.

B. Moore explained what she would like to do. She showed the commission members a drawing of the building’s current floor plan. She is hoping to utilize the upstairs space. She stated that there are 2 bathrooms in the building and that the wall between them would be removed to make it ADA compatible. She is looking at renting it out for a small retail or office space, since the building isn’t very big. She stated that she hasn’t spoken to any prospective tenants at this time. T. Bosma stated that he would abstain from this case. L. Spataro asked if she would reinstall the front canopy as it had been with the support being done with brick columns. He stated that a tenant might wish to have the front canopy closed in instead of open. B. Moore stated that she has no intentions of closing it in. She would like to be able to bring the building to what it used to be, but at this time it would be done with poles. She would like to change it in the future to matching stone.

A motion that HDC recommend to the Planning Commission to approve the request for any retail business or service establishments permitted as Principal Uses in the B-1,

Limited Business District, was made by L. Spataro, supported by A. Brown and approved by majority vote, with T. Bosma abstaining.

Case 2004-40 – Request for approval of new signs to be constructed by Hackley Hospital. Applicant: Hackley Hospital; 1700 Clinton Street; District: Clinton-Peck; Class: A. L. Anguilm presented the staff report. The applicant is requesting to install new signage around the Hackley Hospital campus to update their directional and parking lot signage for the campus. Since these signs are part of the overall theme of signage for the entire Hackley complex, staff recommends approval of the request.

P. LeBlanc went over the plan for the replacement signs. He supplied the commission members with before and after pictures of the signs to be changed. He stated that the signs would have a more historic design to reflect the neighborhood than the current signage.

A motion that HDC approve the request to erect 5 directional and 1 parking lot sign in conjunction with the Hackley Hospital campus with the following conditions: 1) The signs meet all requirements of the City Zoning Ordinance and Building Code. 2) Permits be acquired for all signs which require them, was made by J. Hilt, supported by A. Brown and unanimously approved.

Case 2004 – 41 – Request to install vinyl siding to replace aluminum siding on garage. Applicant: Trent Lidke; 1193 Ransom Street; District: McLaughlin; District: A. L. Anguilm presented the staff report. The applicant is requesting to replace the aluminum siding on the garage with vinyl siding. The underlying cedar siding was damaged by fire and water and some point, and 8” aluminum siding was installed over it. Since it isn’t practical to use aluminum siding again, vinyl has been requested. The vinyl siding would be more the size and appearance of the original 5” cedar siding. Staff recommends approval of the request.

T. Lidke stated that he had purchased the home in order to fix it up. The neighboring home had caught fire and did a lot of damage to the garage. He would like to reproduce the structure as it had been. He would like to change the aluminum siding to vinyl. He brought in samples of the existing siding, clapboard, and proposed siding. He would like the siding to be a darker taupe. He would like to bring the home back to a single-family structure and sell it.

A motion that HDC approve the request to install 5” vinyl siding on the garage at 1193 Ransom Street with the following conditions: 1) Existing cornice or building trim elements shall not be covered or replaced without Commission approval. 2) The wall siding material shall not extend over the existing trim members such door trim, sills, facias, soffits, frieze members and boards, brackets, aprons, corner boards, trim boards, skirt boards, or any other characteristic moldings or architectural features. 3) No building trim elements or architectural features are to be removed or altered to facilitate the installation of the new siding or trim cladding without approval of the Historic District Commission. 4) The window that had been existing on the rear of the garage that was

broken as a result of the fire, may be sided over, was made by L. Spataro, supported by A. Medema and unanimously approved.

WALK-ON

Case 2004-42 – Request for information to turn existing lots into a memorial garden space with parking, gazebo, benches, etc. Applicant: Pam Babbitt and Debi Jensen; 533-545 W Western; District: Clay-Western; Class: AA. The commission members were provided with a list of things that they would like to do. D. Jensen went over the proposed project. She had a drawing rendition of what they would like to possibly do. She is looking for commission member input before proceeding with some set plans. The walkways might be stamped concrete. They would be painting the Babbitt building a complimentary color to the garden. A. Medema asked how this project would blend in and ensure that there would be no problems in the surrounding area. D. Jensen stated that there would be lighting and that they are hoping that there wouldn't be any problems. T. Russo asked if they would be filling the lot to be level with the alley. D. Jensen stated that they would. A. Medema asked who would be maintaining that area. D. Jensen stated that a professional crew would do it. They would also like to install some approved lighting on the sides of the building, as well as some on the property. L. Spataro asked about the fence. D. Jensen stated that the fence placement would be so that people would walk where they shouldn't when going into the area. The fence would be widely spaced metal and about 3 or 4 ft. high. There would be no berming. T. Bosma asked about the time schedule. He felt the building should be looked at to make it more stable. D. Jensen stated that they would like to get started with it this winter and have it completed in the summer. L. Spataro stated that the lighting should be compatible with what is in the area such as what is at the Amazon site. He asked if the parking would be paved. D. Jensen stated that they weren't sure yet. The alley was going to be getting improved and they would like to wait and see what is done with that before making a decision. L. Anguilm stated that the parking would be required to be paved. D. Jensen stated that they would like their parking area to be paved to match the alley paving. L. Spataro stated that the building would need to be finished for the long term. He remembered when the temporary fix had been done a few years back. A. Brown suggested if the Babbitt building were to have offices, having the doors to the offices open toward the garden would be appealing.

No action was needed on this request. It was for information only at this time.

ADJOURN

The meeting adjourned at 5:05 p.m.